SAC GFCM Sub-Committee on Stock Assessment

Date* 5 October	2009 Code* PIL0609Bel
Authors*	Bellido, J.M.1*, Garcia, E.1, Quintanilla, L.2, Torres, P2., Giráldez, A.2, Ceruso, C.1, Alemany, F.3, Iglesias, M.3
Affiliation*	1 Instituto Español de Oceanografía. Centro Oceanográfico de Murcia. C/ Varadero 1. San Pedro del Pinatar. 30740. Murcia. Spain.
Species Scientific name*	1 Source: GFCM Priority Species
	2 Source: -
	3 Source: -
Geographical area*	Western Mediterranean (FAO Subarea 37.1.)
Geographical Sub-Area (GSA)* Combination of GSAs 1 2	06 - Northern Spain
2 3	

Assessment form

Basic data on the assessment

Code: PIL0609Bel

Sheet #0

Date*	5 Oct 2009	Authors*	Bellido, J.M.1*, Garcia, E.1, Quintanilla, L.2, Torres, P2., Giráldez,
			A.2, Ceruso, C.1, Alemany, F.3, Iglesias, M.3

Species	Sardina pilchardus - PIL	Species	Sardine, Sardina
Scientific		common	
name*		name*	

Data Source

GSA*	06 - Northern Spain	Period of time*	1994-2009

Description of the analysis

Type of data*	Landings, Length and biological samplings. Tuning from Purse seiners	Data source*	Official Statistics, IEO Sampling Network, Acoustic Survey
Method of assessment*	Provisional XSA analysis - Extended Survivor Analysis	Software used*	VPA Suite. Lowestoft. 1995 & FLR library

Sheets filled out

В	P1	P2a	P2b	G	A1	A2	A3	Y	Other	D	Z	С
1	1	1	1		1	1	1			1	1	1

Comments, bibliography, etc.

The provisional XSA analysis was not accepted as a basis for advice. The main reasons were the use of a common ALK for some years, and doubts about the natural mortality. The XSA analysis may be indicative of trends in recruitment and biomass, but the fishing mortality estimates are highly uncertain. Therefore the advise is based on direct evidences.

Comments, bibliography, etc.

Bibliography (Published papers and books):

Abella A., Caddy J.F., Serena F. (1997) Declining natural mortality with age and fisheries on juveniles: a Mediterranean demersal fishery yield paradigm illustrated for Merluccius merluccius. Aquatic Living Resources 10: 257–269.

Caddy, J.F. (1991). Death rates and time intervals: Is there an alternative to the constant natural mortality axiom? Rev. Fish Bio/. Fisheries, 1: 109-13 8.

De Oliveira, J.A.A., Uriante, A., and Roel, B., 2005. Potential improvements in the management of Bay of Biscay anchovy by incorporating environmental indices as recruitmen predictors. Fisheries Research, 75: 2-14.

Freon, P. and Misund, O.A., 1999. Dynamics of Pelagic Fish Distribution and Behaviour: Effects on Fisheries and Stock Assessment. Fishing News Books, UK, 348 pp.

Hilborn, R. and Walters C.J., 1992. quantitative Fisheries Stock Assessment; Choice, Dynamics and Uncertainty. New York: Chapman and Hall, 570 pp.

Lleonard, J. and Maynou, F., 2003. Fish Stock Assessment in the Mediterranean: state of the art. Scientia Marina, 67: 37-49.

Patterson, K., 1992. Fisheries for small pelagic species: an empirical approach to management targets. Review in Fish Biology and Fisheries, 2: 321-338.

Ramon M.M and Castro, J.A., 1997. Genetic variation in natural stocks of Sardina pilchardus (Sardines) from the western Mediterranean Sea. Heredity, 78: 520-528.

Sheperd, J.G., 1999. Extended Survivors Analysis: An improved method for the analysis of catch-atage data and abundance indices. Journal of Marine Science, 56: 584-591.

Bibliography (Technical Reports and grey literature):

Darby, C.D. and Flatman, S., 1994. Virtual Population Analysis, version 3.1 (Windows/DOS) user guide. Information Technology Series 1. CEFAS, Lowestoft, UK.

Reports from the SCSA and SAC of the General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean (GFCM), available at http://www.fao.org/fi/body/rfb/GFCM/gfcm_home.htm and/or ftp://cucafera.icm.csic.es/pub/scsa/

Reports from the Assessment Working Groups of the International Council for the Exploration of the Seas (ICES), particularly the small pelagics assessment working group WGMHSA. Available at www.ices.dk

Reports from the SGMED Working Groups on the Mediterranean of the Scientific, Technical and Economic Committee for Fisheries (STECF). Available at http://fishnet.jrc.it/web/stecf.

Assessment form

Biology of the species

Code: PIL0609Bel

Sheet B

Biology								
Somatic magnitude measured (LH, LC, etc)*				Total Length		Units*	1/2 centimeter	
	Sex	Fem	Mal	Both	Unsexed			
Maximum	size observed			22		Reproductio	on season	Oct-Mar
Size at firs	t maturity			13.3		Reproductio	on areas	All the coast
Recruitme	nt size			8.5		Nursery are	as	Bays

Parameters used (state units and information sources)

		Units	female	male	both	unsexed
	L∞	cm			22	
Growth model	К	year-1			0.4586	
Growth model	tO	year			-1.4157	
	Data source	Otoliths				
Length weight	а				0.0059	
relationship	b				3.1406	
						-
	М			M vector (see comments)		

sex ratio (mal/fem) 44/56

Comments

ALK 2003-2007, combined ALK for 1994-2002, 2008 and 2009. Length Distributions 1994-2009.

Biological sampling 2004-2009 for Maturity at age and Weight-Length relationships.

Natural Mortality value (M) - Following the recommendation from the Workshop on Mediterranean Stock Assessment Standardization (SG-ECA/RST/MED 09-01), a vector (declining value of M with age) instead of a constant value was used. The vector was estimated using the ProdBiom method (Abella et al., 1997) based on Caddy (1991).

Age	Μ
0	1.20
1	0.46
2	0.34
3	0.29
4	0.26
5+	0.25

Comments

Assessment form

General information about the fishery

Code: PIL0609Bel

Sheet P1

Data source*	Official Statistics, IEO Sar	npling Network, Acoustic	Year (s)*	1994-2009
Data aggregation figures between	on (by year, average n years, etc.)*	By year 1994-2008		

Fleet and catches (please state units)

	Country	GSA	Fleet Segment	Fishing Gear Class	Group of Target Species	Species
Operational Unit 1*	ESP	06	G - Purse Seine (6-12 metres)	02 - Seine Nets	31 - Small gregarious pelagic	PIL
Operational Unit 2	ESP	06	H - Purse Seine (12-24 metres)	02 - Seine Nets	31 - Small gregarious pelagic	PIL
Operational Unit 3	ESP	06	F - Trawl (>24 metres)	02 - Seine Nets	31 - Small gregarious pelagic	PIL
Operational Unit 4						
Operational Unit 5						

Operational Units*	Fleet (n°of boats)*	Kilos or Tons	Catch (species assessed)	Other species caught	Discards (species assessed)	Discards (other species caught)	Effort units
ESP 06 G 02 31 - PIL	4	Tons	7896				
ESP 06 H 02 31 - PIL	111	Tons					
ESP 06 F 02 31 - PIL	17	Tons					
Total	132		7896				

Legal minimum size 11 cm TL

Comments

The catch (landings) is not split by Fleet segments. It comprises 7896 Tons in 2009 for the three Operational Units. Although landings are not still separated by Fleet segments we can provide a segmentation of the pelagic fleet in GSA06, with number of boats for every fleet segment:

The Fleet Segment Purse Seine (6-12 metres) comprises 4 boats in 2009 The Fleet Segment Purse Seine (12-24 metres) comprises 111 boats in 2009 The Fleet Segment Purse Seine (greater than 24 metres) comprises 17 boats in 2009

Then, and because that landing aggregation, we prefer to fill pages P2a and P2b considering the three fleet segments as an unique pelagic fleet.

Landing Ports are shown in the attached Figure. Sampling ports are highlighted in blue. Tuning data from acoustic survey ECOMED (2003-2009) and MEDIAS (2009) were used.

Comments



Assessment form

Sheet P2a Fishery by Operational Unit

Code: PIL0609Bel

Page 1/3

Data source*	Official Statistics, IEO Sampling Network	OpUnit 1*	ESP 06 G 02 31 - PIL

Time series

Year*	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003
Catch	32274 t	36142 t	36972 t	30275 t	18762 t	20817 t
Minimum size	9.5 cm	6 cm	9 cm	9 cm	8 cm	6.5 cm
Average size Lc	16.66 cm	16.78 cm	16.72 cm	16.9 cm	16.56 cm	16.84 cm
Maximum size	19.5 cm	20 cm	20 cm	20.5 cm	20.5 cm	22 cm
Fleet	223		207	179	157	161

Year	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Catch	24874 t	22081 t	29381 t	23984 t	14123 t	7896 t
Minimum size	6.5 cm	9 cm	9 cm	9.5 cm	9.0 cm	8.5 cm
Average size Lc	17.02 cm	16.87 cm	16.08 cm	17.81 cm	16.9 cm	17.82 cm
Maximum size	23.5 cm	22.5 cm	22.5 cm	22.5 cm	22.0 cm	22.00 cm
Fleet	155	147	139	132	132	132

Selectivity

Remarks

	AL 13
Selection factor	
L75	
L50	
L25	

adine Catch in Numbers (thousands)

Stru	cture	by size	e or ag	^{;e} 1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	200 3	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Age D	494569	594098	866001	4 259 22	355520	193194	341.089	197682	187372	232292	179311	240491	95769	189211	64546	148125
Age 1	9417B1	919897	831054	653478	585036	59 84 99	633136	477321	3401.32	315204	565322	394545	418667	347590	142840	123068
Age 2	300744	245670	160898	178067	154908	226685	207861	193755	103026	111670	105701	155411	363762	171745	107209	30975
Age 3	54740	32776	29361	2730 1	26023	36172	38368	36363	15893	19612	24194	36016	68543	54387	49823	3721
Age 4	6857	2983	3459	2623	3219	3433	5734	6247	1406	3263	8596	6123	11390	16573	1 59 91	719
Age 5	1375	450	516	275	387	319	672	945	123	515	3198	1444	1000	2450	2490	3365



Structure by size or age



Assessment form

Fishery by Operational Unit

Code: PIL0609Bel

Page 1 / 1

Sheet P2b

Data source*	Official Statistics, IEO Sampling Network	OpUnit 1*	ESP 06 G 02 31 - PIL

Regulations in force and degree of observance of regulations

Fishing license: fully observed Minimum landing size 11cm: not fully observed (Some landings under minimum size in some specific ports).

No fishing allowed on weekend. Time at sea 12 hours per day and 5 days a week: fully observed Several technical measures regulations (gear and mesh size, engine, GRT, etc...): not fully observed Temporary fishing closure (two months, variable along the time series): fully observed.

Accompanying species

The most important are: Anchovy (*Engraulis encrasicolus*) Mediterranean Horse Mackerel (*Trachurus mediterraneus*) Other Horse Mackerels (*Trachurus trachurus* and *Tachurus picturatus*) Mackerel (*Scomber scombrus*) Chub Mackerel (*Scomber japonicus*) Round sardinella (*Sardinella aurita*) Bogue (*Boops boops*)

Assessment form

Both

Sheet A1 Indirect methods: VPA, LCA

Analysis # *

Code: PIL0609Bel

Page 1 / 1

XSA

Time series

Sex*

Data	Size	Age
(mark with X)	Х	Х

Model	Cohorts	Pseudocohorts
(mark with X)	Х	

Equation used	VPA	Tunig method	XSA
# of gears	Purse seiners	Software	VPA95. Lowestoft suite
F _{terminal}	Not relevant to XSA		

Population results (please state units)

	Sizes	Ages		Amount	Biomass
Minimum	8.5	0	Recruitment	2300 millions	
Average	See page 2a		Average population	See coments be	elow
Maximum	22	5+	Virgin population		
Critical			Turnover		

Average mortality

		Gear					
_	Total						
F ₁	Fbar=1.20						
F ₂							
Z	See Comments						

(F1 and F2 represent different possible calculations. Please state them)

Comments

Reference F is Fbar1-3 (average of ages 1 to 3 are considered the reference ages of this fishery). Following the recommendation from the Workshop on Mediterranean Stock Assessment Standardization (SG-ECA/RST/MED 09-01), a vector instead of a constant value was used. The vector was estimated using the ProdBiom method (Abella et al., 1997) based on Caddy (1991).

An exploratory analysis was conducted estimating a Log Catch Curves analysis. Log Catch Curves show no conflicts between ages and cohorts follow the standard pattern level of an exploited cohort when entering and passing through the fishery. Log Catch Curves can be seen in the figure below.

Landings decrease in 2009, reaching up 7896 t, which represents the lowest landings of the assessed time series. Fishing mortality is at a moderate-high level (F09=0.1.20), lower to that of 2008 (2.52). Recruitment in 2009 (2300 millions) is higher to 2008 (R08=1155 millions) following a decreasing trend from 2003 onwards. The trend of the recruitments is so important as they can affect seriously to the stock health. Both Total Biomass(TB=52960 t) and Spawning Stock Biomass (SSB=25970 t) in 2009 are also the between the lowest of the time series.

SAC GFCM - Sub-Committee on Stock Assessment (SCSA)									
Accommont form	Sheet A2								
Assessment form	Indirect methods: data								
	C	ode: PIL0609Bel							
Sex* Both Gear* Purse seiners	Analysis # *	XSA							
Data Input data for XSA									

Data



	SAC GFCM - Sub-Committee on Stock Assessment (SCSA)						
Acces	omont fo	rm		Sheet A3			
Assessment form Indirect methods:					ct methods: VPA results		
					Code: PIL0609Bel		
					Page 1 / 1		
Sex*	Both	Gear*	Purse Seiners	Analysis #*	XSA		

Population in figures



Fishing mortality rates

Assessment form

Sheet other

Code: PIL0609Bel

Page 1 /

Other assessment methods



Assessment form

Sheet D Diagnosis

Code: PIL0609Bel

Indicators and reference points

Criterion	Current value	Units	Reference Point	Trend	Comments
В					Not Reference Point defined yet
SSB					Not Reference Point defined yet
F					Not Reference Point defined yet
Y					Not Reference Point defined yet
CPUE					Not Reference Point defined yet

Stock Status* Use one (or both) of the following two systems for the stock assessment status description

	\Box	? - (or blank) Not known or uncertain. Not much information is available to make a judgment;
		U - Underexploited, undeveloped or new fishery. Believed to have a significant potential for expansion in total production;
lal		M - Moderately exploited, exploited with a low level of fishing effort. Believed to have some limited potential for expansion in total production;
ension		F - Fully exploited. The fishery is operating at or close to an optimal yield level, with no expected room for further expansion;
nidime	Ο	O - Overexploited. The fishery is being exploited at above a level which is believed to be sustainable in the long term, with no potential room for further expansion and a higher risk of stock depletion/collapse;
5		D - Depleted. Catches are well below historical levels, irrespective of the amount of fishing effort exerted;
	\Box	R - Recovering. Catches are again increasing after having been depleted or a collapse from a previous;

	Exploitatio	n rate	Stock abundance				
nal	No or low	fishing		Virgin or high abundance	\odot	Depleted	
sio	C Moderate	fishing	\odot	Intermediate abundance		Uncertain / Not	
ner	🚺 🛛 High fishi	ng mortality	0	Low abundance		assessed	
din	🖸 Uncertain	/ Not assessed			-		
Bi							

Comments

Lacking a reliable analytic assessment, the advice is based on evidence in the fishery and survey data. The catches have had a strong downwards trend throughout the time series (which goes back to 1994.) The 2009 catch is the lowest on record. In the length composition in the catches, the balance between small and large fish has been relatively stable, except in 2009, it si strongly skewed towards small fish.

According to the survey, the recruitment has declined gradually since 2003, but with a stronger year class in 2009. Fish from age 1 and upwards has been almost absent in the survey since 2007, and has virtually disappeared in 2009.

This evidence points in the direction of the recruitment as a main driving force in the population dynamics, where the stock and catches have declined as a result of a declining recruitment. In addition, the length distributions and age distributions indicate that older fish is depleted more rapidly in recent years, in particular after 2007. The reason for that is not clear, but the fishery must be at least partly responsible. Migration to other areas is not likely as the the same trends are seen in GSA07. The stock biomass in itself is not known, but it seems likely that it has declined in line with the decline in the catches and survey index.

Although the recruitment in 2009 is encouraging, the incoming year class now dominates the stock almost completely. The exploitation rate is not known, but it is likely that it is high, as the year classes are depelted rapidly. To improve the situation and restore a normal age composition in the stock and thereby facilitate further good recruitments, a reduction in the exploitation rate seems necessary.

Assessment form

Objectives and recommendations

Code: PIL0609Bel

Sheet Z

Management advice and recommendations*

The stock has declined over many years, partly due to reduced recruitment and partly to poor survival ov the recruits. Most likely, the stock has been increasingly overexploited in recent years. The 2009 year class looks promising, but it is necessary to preserve that year class to restore a normal stock structure and facilitate better future recruitments. Unless the recruitment levels increase in the near future, this fishery will be being exploited at above a level which is believed to be sustainable in the long term, with no potential room for further expansion and a higher risk of stock depletion/collapse. Therefore, a substantial reduction in exploitation is advised.

Taking into account the possible link between GSA06 and GSA07, which includes parallell changes in the ecosystem in the most recent years, it is also advised to harmonize management measures in the two areas, to ensure that they are restricctive in both areas.

Advice for scientific research*

Assessment form

Sheet C Comments

Code: PIL0609Bel

Page 1 / 1

Comments*

Landings have decreased gradually since 1998, from over 32000 tons to less than 8000 tons. There are indications both in the surveys and the catch data that the recruitment has declined over the last ten years. The XSA assessment is not acceptable as a basis for the advise but may give indications of the trend in biomass and the recruitment which are both strongly declining.

Conclusions - Management considerations:

This stock is at a low level. Unless the recruitment levels increase in the near future, this fishery will be being exploited at above a level which is believed to be sustainable in the long term, with no potential room for further expansion and a higher risk of stock depletion/collapse.

Abstract for SCSA reporting

Authors	Bellido, J.M.1 ³ P2., Giráldez, J Iglesias M 3	Year 2009		
Species Sci	entific name	Sardina pilchardus - PIL		
		Source: GFCM Priority Species Source: -		
		Source: -		
Geographic	cal Sub-Area	06 - Northern Spain		

Fisheries (brief description of the fishery)*

Sardine (Sardina pilchardus) and anchovy (Engraulis encrasicolus) are the main target species of the purse seine fleet in Northern Spain GSA06, but other species with lower economical importance are also captured, sometimes representing a high percentage of the capture: horse mackerel (Trachurus spp.), mackerel (Scomber spp.), frigate mackerel (Auxis rochei), Atlantic saury (Scomberesox saurus) and gilt sardine (Sardinella aurita).

This report is exclusively focused on fishery of sardine.

Source of management advice*

(brief description of material -data- and methods used for the assessment)

Fishery assessment by VPA methods of the Spanish sardine stock GSA06 is shown. VPA Lowestoft software suite was used and XSA was the assessment method. A separable VPA was also run as exploratory analysis for both stocks. Stochastic short term projections were also produced.

Data used:

Landings from 1994-2009 from all Fishery ports from GSA06.

ALK 2004-2009, combined ALK for 1994-2003. Length Distributions 1994-2009. Biological sampling 2004-2009 for Maturity at age and Weight-Length relationships. Tuning data from acoustic survey ECOMED (2003-2008) and Medias (2009).

Stock Status*

O - Overexploited. The fishery is being exploited at above a level which is believed to be sustainable in the long term, with no potential room for further expansion and a higher risk of stock depletion/collapse;

Exploitation rate

Uncertain / Not assessed

Stock abundance

Low abundance

Comments

Lacking a reliable analytic assessment, the advice is based on evidence in the fishery and survey data. The catches have had a strong downwards trend throughout the time series (which goes back to 1994.) The 2009 catch is the lowest on record. In the length composition in the catches, the balance between small and large fish has been relatively stable, except in 2009, it si strongly skewed towards small fish.

According to the survey, the recruitment has declined gradually since 2003, but with a stronger year class in 2009. Fish from age 1 and upwards has been almost absent in the survey since 2007, and has virtually disappeared in 2009.

This evidence points in the direction of the recruitment as a main driving force in the population dynamics, where the stock and catches have declined as a result of a declining recruitment. In addition, the length distributions and age distributions indicate that older fish is depleted more rapidly in recent years, in particular after 2007. The reason for that is not clear, but the fishery must be at least partly responsible. Migration to other areas is not likely as the the same trends are seen in GSA07. The stock biomass in itself is not known, but it seems likely that it has declined in line with the decline in the catches and survey index.

Although the recruitment in 2009 is encouraging, the incoming year class now dominates the stock almost completely. The exploitation rate is not known, but it is likely that it is high, as the year classes are depelted rapidly. To improve the situation and restore a normal age composition in the stock and thereby facilitate further good recruitments, a reduction in the exploitation rate seems necessary.

Management advice and recommendations*

The stock has declined over many years, partly due to reduced recruitment and partly to poor survival ov the recruits. Most likely, the stock has been increasingly overexploited in recent years. The 2009 year class looks promising, but it is necessary to preserve that year class to restore a normal stock structure and facilitate better future recruitments. Unless the recruitment levels increase in the near future, this fishery will be being exploited at above a level which is believed to be sustainable in the long term, with no potential room for further expansion and a higher risk of stock depletion/collapse. Therefore, a substantial reduction in exploitation is advised.

Taking into account the possible link between GSA06 and GSA07, which includes parallell changes in the ecosystem in the most recent years, it is also advised to harmonize management measures in the two areas, to ensure that they are restricctive in both areas.

Advice for scientific research*